

|  |  |
|--|--|
| Meeting of:  | <b>Governance and Audit Committee</b>  |
| Date of Meeting:   | <b>Monday, 22 April 2024</b>   |
| Relevant Scrutiny Committee:   | Corporate Performance and Resources  |
| Report Title:  | Recommendation Monitoring  |
| Purpose of Report:   | To provide members of the Committee with a position statement on internal audit recommendations made, implemented and outstanding. |
| Report Owner:  | Head of the Regional Internal Audit Service  |
| Responsible Officer:   | Head of Finance & Section 151 Officer  |
| Elected Member and Officer Consultation:   | No Elected Members have been consulted. Legal Services and Head of Finance.  |
| Policy Framework:  | The proposals in this report are in accordance with the policy framework and budget.   |
| <p>Executive Summary:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A position statement in respect of internal audit high and medium priority recommendations made, implemented and outstanding as of 28<sup>th</sup> March 2024 is detailed in <b>Appendix A</b>.</li> <li>• A total of 124 high and medium priority recommendations have been made following the conclusion of audits from the 2023-24 annual plan. All have been agreed and to date 66 have been implemented, 58 have a future implementation date and none are overdue.</li> <li>• In addition, no recommendations are overdue in respect of audits completed prior to this current financial year either.</li> <li>• One medium priority recommendation, made in an audit undertaken in 2021-22, still has a future target date for implementation. In addition, 12 recommendations made in 2022/23 audits have a future target date and these continue to be monitored.</li> <li>• The monitoring of recommendations is undertaken regularly by Auditors and any undue delays or issues are highlighted to Senior Management and ultimately this Committee.</li> </ul> |  |

## Recommendations

1. That members of the Governance and Audit Committee consider the information provided in respect of the status of the high and medium recommendations made.

## Reasons for Recommendations

1. To keep the Governance and Audit Committee informed on the status of Internal Audit Recommendations.

### 1. Background

- 1.1 In accordance with the Public Sector Internal Audit Standards, the internal audit activity must assess and make appropriate recommendations to improve the Council’s governance, risk management and internal control. The Regional Internal Audit Service (RIAS) Strategy states that the implementation of agreed recommendations will be monitored.
- 1.2 Recommendations are made at the conclusion of an audit review if it is felt that improvements should be made to mitigate risk and strengthen controls. Recommendations are included, if appropriate, in the final audit report and recipients are asked to provide responses to indicate whether they agree with the recommendations and how and when they plan to implement them. To assist managers in focussing their attention, each recommendation is classified as being either high, medium and low priority.
- 1.3 Table 1 shows the recommendation categorisation as follows:

| Table 1 – Recommendation Categorisation  |  |
|--|--|
| Risk may be viewed as the chance, or probability, of one or more of the organisation’s objectives not being met. It refers both to unwanted outcomes which might arise, and to the potential failure to realise desired results. The criticality of each recommendation is as follows: |  |
| <b>High Priority</b>   | Action that is considered imperative to ensure that the organisation is not exposed to high risks. |
| <b>Medium Priority</b>   | Action that is considered necessary to avoid exposure to significant risks.                        |
| <b>Low Priority</b>  | Action that is considered desirable and should result in enhanced control.                         |

- 1.4 To ensure maximum coverage of the annual plan based on the capacity available within the team, the RIAS monitors the implementation of the high and medium priority recommendations, but the low priority recommendations are left to management to successfully implement.
- 1.5 Once the target date for implementation has been reached the relevant Officers will be contacted and asked to provide feedback on the status of each agreed high and medium priority recommendation. The implementation of these

recommendations is monitored using MK Insight internal audit software to ensure that improvements are being made.

- 1.6 Any audits concluded with a no assurance or limited assurance opinion will also be subject to a follow up audit.

## 2. Key Issues for Consideration

- 2.1 **Appendix A** provides a summary of the status of the high and medium priority internal audit recommendations made as of 28<sup>th</sup> March 2024.

- 2.2 The status of the recommendations that have been made following the completion of audits from the 2023-24 audit plan is summarised in Table 2 below.

**Table 2 – Recommendation Status – Audits Completed 2023-24**

|         | No. Made |      |       | Not Agreed | Imp. | Overdue |      |       | Future Target Date |
|---------|----------|------|-------|------------|------|---------|------|-------|--------------------|
|         | High     | Med. | Total |            |      | High    | Med. | Total |                    |
| 2023-24 | 20       | 104  | 124   | 0          | 66   | 0       | 0    | 0     | 58                 |

- 2.3 **Appendix A** also includes the recommendations made in relation to audits completed in the audit plans of 2021-22 and 2022-23 which are yet to be implemented. This information is summarised in Table 3.

**Table 3 – Outstanding Recommendation – Audits Completed Pre-2023-24**

|         | No. Made |      |       | Not Agreed | Imp. | Overdue |      |       | Future Target Date |
|---------|----------|------|-------|------------|------|---------|------|-------|--------------------|
|         | High     | Med. | Total |            |      | High    | Med. | Total |                    |
| 2021-22 | 0        | 2    | 2     | 0          | 1    | 0       | 0    | 0     | 1                  |
| 2022-23 | 9        | 31   | 40    | 0          | 28   | 0       | 0    | 0     | 12                 |

Table 3 shows that there are currently no recommendations overdue.

- 2.4 As previously reported, the one recommendation made during the 2021-22 which still has a future implementation date is in relation to the Corporate Safeguarding. This recommendation has been discussed with Committee previously and work is ongoing to fully implement the agreed action by the target date provided. In addition, 12 recommendations made during 2022-23 still have a future target date.

- 2.5 The monitoring of recommendations is undertaken regularly by Auditors and any undue delays or issues are highlighted to Senior Management and ultimately this Committee.

### **3. How do proposals evidence the Five Ways of Working and contribute to our Well-being Objectives?**

- 3.1** The Annual Risk Based Plan contains audit reviews that will be service specific and that will assist in understanding how those services undertake the five ways of working and how they deliver the well-being objectives.

### **4. Climate Change and Nature Implications**

- 4.1** None as a consequence of this report.

### **5. Resources and Legal Considerations**

#### **Financial**

- 5.1** There are no resource implications as a direct consequence of this report, but recommendations made will assist in ensuring that the Council's assets and interests are properly accounted for and safeguarded.

#### **Employment**

- 5.2** None as a direct consequence of this report.

#### **Legal (Including Equalities)**

- 5.3** The provision of an adequate and effective Internal Audit function is a legal requirement under the Accounts and Audit (Wales) Regulations 2014 as amended from time to time. There are no equalities implications as a direct consequence of this report.

### **6. Background Papers**

None

Internal Audit - Recommendation Monitoring Report - 28th March 2024

| Audit Name   | Directorate           | Audit Opinion | Final Report Date | Number Made |            |            | Not Agreed | Implemented |           |           | Outstanding |          |          | Future Target Date |
|--|-----------------------|---------------|-------------------|-------------|------------|------------|------------|-------------|-----------|-----------|-------------|----------|----------|--------------------|
|  |                       |               |                   | High        | Medium     | Total      |            | High        | Medium    | Total     | High        | Medium   | Total    | Total              |
| <b>2021/22</b>   |                       |               |                   |             |            |            |            |             |           |           |             |          |          |                    |
| Corporate Safeguarding   | Cross Cutting         | REASONABLE    | 10/08/2021        | 0           | 2          | 2          | 0          | 0           | 1         | 1         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 1                  |
|  |                       |               |                   | <b>0</b>    | <b>2</b>   | <b>2</b>   | <b>0</b>   | <b>0</b>    | <b>1</b>  | <b>1</b>  | <b>0</b>    | <b>0</b> | <b>0</b> | <b>1</b>           |
| <b>2022/23</b>   |                       |               |                   |             |            |            |            |             |           |           |             |          |          |                    |
| NFI - Residents Parking Permits  | Cross Cutting         | REASONABLE    | 06/03/2023        | 0           | 1          | 1          | 0          | 0           | 0         | 0         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 1                  |
| Vehicles Fuel Management   | Environment & Housing | REASONABLE    | 20/04/2023        | 0           | 5          | 5          | 0          | 0           | 4         | 4         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 1                  |
| Ysgol Y Deri & St Cyres Building Compliance                                | Learning & Skills     | LIMITED       | 20/04/2023        | 5           | 2          | 7          | 0          | 4           | 2         | 6         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 1                  |
| Risk Management  | Cross Cutting         | SUBSTANTIAL   | 03/05/2023        | 0           | 1          | 1          | 0          | 0           | 0         | 0         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 1                  |
| Attendance & Sickness Recording  | Corporate Resources   | LIMITED       | 23/05/2023        | 1           | 4          | 5          | 0          | 1           | 2         | 3         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 2                  |
| Civil Enforcement  | Environment & Housing | LIMITED       | 30/05/2023        | 3           | 3          | 6          | 0          | 3           | 2         | 5         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 1                  |
| School Unofficial Funds  | Learning & Skills     | REASONABLE    | 30/05/2023        | 0           | 7          | 7          | 0          | 0           | 6         | 6         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 1                  |
| Governance and Performance Review : Local Authority Trading Company (LATC) | Learning & Skills     | LIMITED       | 20/06/2023        | 0           | 8          | 8          | 0          | 0           | 4         | 4         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 4                  |
|  |                       |               |                   | <b>9</b>    | <b>31</b>  | <b>40</b>  | <b>0</b>   | <b>8</b>    | <b>20</b> | <b>28</b> | <b>0</b>    | <b>0</b> | <b>0</b> | <b>12</b>          |
| <b>2023/24</b>   |                       |               |                   |             |            |            |            |             |           |           |             |          |          |                    |
| Housing Rents  | Environment & Housing | REASONABLE    | 12/06/2023        | 0           | 1          | 1          | 0          | 0           | 1         | 1         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 0                  |
| Appointeeships & Deputyships   | Social Services       | LIMITED       | 03/07/2023        | 2           | 1          | 3          | 0          | 1           | 1         | 2         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 1                  |
| SRS Joint Service - Governance & Financial Controls                        | Environment & Housing | REASONABLE    | 05/07/2023        | 0           | 1          | 1          | 0          | 0           | 1         | 1         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 0                  |
| File Systems & Folder Access   | Corporate Resources   | REASONABLE    | 26/07/2023        | 0           | 1          | 1          | 0          | 0           | 1         | 1         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 0                  |
| Housing Benefit Overpayments & Recovery                                    | Corporate Resources   | REASONABLE    | 14/08/2023        | 0           | 3          | 3          | 0          | 0           | 2         | 2         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 1                  |
| Oracle Fusion - Expenses Module  | Corporate Resources   | REASONABLE    | 18/08/2023        | 1           | 1          | 2          | 0          | 0           | 1         | 1         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 1                  |
| Bus Services Support Grant 22/23   | Cross Cutting         | REASONABLE    | 23/08/2023        | 0           | 1          | 1          | 0          | 0           | 1         | 1         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 0                  |
| Bottomline PTX Grant Payments  | Corporate Resources   | REASONABLE    | 24/08/2023        | 0           | 1          | 1          | 0          | 0           | 1         | 1         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 0                  |
| Fraudulent Change in Bank Details  | Corporate Resources   | N/A           | 08/09/2023        | 1           | 1          | 2          | 0          | 1           | 1         | 2         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 0                  |
| RCSIG Grant Verification 22/23   | Learning & Skills     | REASONABLE    | 12/09/2023        | 0           | 1          | 1          | 0          | 0           | 1         | 1         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 0                  |
| HSG Grant 2022-23 Certification  | Cross Cutting         | REASONABLE    | 14/09/2023        | 0           | 1          | 1          | 0          | 0           | 1         | 1         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 0                  |
| PCI-DSS Follow Up  | Cross Cutting         | LIMITED       | 21/09/2023        | 0           | 3          | 3          | 0          | 0           | 0         | 0         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 3                  |
| Enable Grant 2022-23 Certification   | Cross Cutting         | SUBSTANTIAL   | 23/10/2023        | 0           | 1          | 1          | 0          | 0           | 0         | 0         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 1                  |
| Content Manager (TRIM)   | Corporate Resources   | SUBSTANTIAL   | 26/10/2023        | 0           | 1          | 1          | 0          | 0           | 1         | 1         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 0                  |
| Stanwell School  | Learning & Skills     | REASONABLE    | 26/10/2023        | 1           | 4          | 5          | 0          | 1           | 4         | 5         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 0                  |
| Adult Placement (Shared Lives) Service                                     | Social Services       | LIMITED       | 06/11/2023        | 2           | 7          | 9          | 0          | 1           | 5         | 6         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 3                  |
| Libraries & Digital Equipment  | Learning & Skills     | LIMITED       | 09/11/2023        | 1           | 4          | 5          | 0          | 1           | 1         | 2         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 3                  |
| SRS Joint Service - Food Hygiene   | Environment & Housing | REASONABLE    | 13/11/2023        | 0           | 2          | 2          | 0          | 0           | 2         | 2         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 0                  |
| Officer Code of Conduct  | Corporate Resources   | LIMITED       | 14/11/2023        | 0           | 7          | 7          | 0          | 0           | 4         | 4         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 3                  |
| Stanwell School Capital Project  | Learning & Skills     | N/A           | 17/11/2023        | 8           | 0          | 8          | 0          | 8           | 0         | 8         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 0                  |
| Corporate Complaints & Compliments   | Cross Cutting         | REASONABLE    | 11/12/2023        | 0           | 3          | 3          | 0          | 0           | 1         | 1         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 2                  |
| Debtors  | Corporate Resources   | LIMITED       | 14/12/2023        | 0           | 7          | 7          | 0          | 0           | 1         | 1         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 6                  |
| Leisure Centres – Contract & Performance Monitoring                        | Environment & Housing | LIMITED       | 15/12/2023        | 0           | 6          | 6          | 0          | 0           | 3         | 3         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 3                  |
| Mobile Devices   | Cross Cutting         | REASONABLE    | 18/12/2023        | 0           | 3          | 3          | 0          | 0           | 2         | 2         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 1                  |
| Welsh Language Standards   | Cross Cutting         | REASONABLE    | 20/12/2023        | 0           | 5          | 5          | 0          | 0           | 0         | 0         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 5                  |
| Recycling & Waste Management   | Environment & Housing | REASONABLE    | 04/01/2024        | 1           | 4          | 5          | 0          | 1           | 0         | 1         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 4                  |
| Residential & Non Residential Financial Assessments                        | Social Services       | REASONABLE    | 05/01/2024        | 1           | 1          | 2          | 0          | 0           | 0         | 0         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 2                  |
| Colcot Primary School  | Learning & Skills     | REASONABLE    | 22/01/2024        | 1           | 6          | 7          | 0          | 1           | 6         | 7         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 0                  |
| St Cyres School  | Learning & Skills     | REASONABLE    | 23/01/2024        | 0           | 7          | 7          | 0          | 0           | 3         | 3         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 4                  |
| Llantwit Major Comp Follow Up  | Learning & Skills     | REASONABLE    | 30/01/2024        | 0           | 5          | 5          | 0          | 0           | 3         | 3         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 2                  |
| Disposal of Electronic Media & Devices                                     | Corporate Resources   | REASONABLE    | 06/02/2024        | 0           | 2          | 2          | 0          | 0           | 0         | 0         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 2                  |
| Security & Access to Council Buildings                                     | Cross Cutting         | REASONABLE    | 06/02/2024        | 1           | 5          | 6          | 0          | 1           | 0         | 1         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 5                  |
| Shared Prosperity Fund   | Place                 | REASONABLE    | 16/02/2024        | 0           | 2          | 2          | 0          | 0           | 2         | 2         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 0                  |
| Residential Homes - Food Costs & Stock Control                             | Internal Audit        | LIMITED       | 20/02/2024        | 0           | 3          | 3          | 0          | 0           | 0         | 0         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 3                  |
| Cleaning Services  | Environment & Housing | REASONABLE    | 19/03/2024        | 0           | 3          | 3          | 0          | 0           | 0         | 0         | 0           | 0        | 0        | 3                  |
|  |                       |               |                   | <b>20</b>   | <b>104</b> | <b>124</b> | <b>0</b>   | <b>16</b>   | <b>50</b> | <b>66</b> | <b>0</b>    | <b>0</b> | <b>0</b> | <b>58</b>          |