

THE VALE OF GLAMORGAN COUNCIL

LEARNING AND CULTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE: 15TH APRIL, 2021

REFERENCE FROM CABINET: 22ND MARCH, 2021

“C528 REVIEW OF STATUES, MONUMENTS, STREET NAMES AND BUILDING NAMES – REVIEW PANEL TERMS OF REFERENCE (L/PR) (SCRUTINY – LEARNING AND CULTURE) –

In January 2021, Cabinet approved the Terms of Reference for the Review Panel to assist in the review of statues, monuments, street names and building names in the Vale of Glamorgan, in light of the Black Lives Matter movement as previously requested by Cabinet in November 2020.

The Panel met for the first time and had proposed that Cabinet consider making changes to the Terms of Reference to change the membership which would enhance the inclusivity and independence of the Panel, including to include other political groups and to consider whether a standing representative from a history society should be included, or specific advice sought from individual experts on individual matters.

The Deputy Leader said that the Panel should be fleet of foot and the proposed changes to the Terms of Reference as a result of the first meeting would provide one degree of separation from Cabinet.

Councillor Williams recognised that time had been taken to establish the right membership of the Panel in order to produce proposals that would properly suit and represent the residents of the Vale of Glamorgan.

This was a matter for Executive decision.

Cabinet, having considered the report and all the issues and implications contained therein

RESOLVED –

- (1) T H A T the report be noted.
- (2) T H A T the revised Terms of Reference for the Review Panel as described in the report and at Appendix A be endorsed.
- (3) T H A T, subject to Recommendation (2), Democratic Services contact the Leaders of the Council's political groups to request one nomination each to join the Review Panel.

(4) T H A T the report be referred to Learning and Culture Scrutiny Committee for their consideration and to provide a further update on the work of the Review.

Reasons for decisions

(1) Having regard to the contents of the report and discussions at the meeting.

(2) Having considered the Panel's proposals regarding the membership of the Review Panel.

(3) To enable the representation as proposed.

(4) To provide Learning and Culture Scrutiny Committee with an update as matters were progressing.”

Attached as Appendix – Report to Cabinet: 22nd March, 2021

Meeting of:	Cabinet
Date of Meeting:	Monday, 22 March 2021
Relevant Scrutiny Committee:	Learning and Culture
Report Title:	Review of Statues, Monuments, Street Names and Building Names - Review Panel Terms of Reference
Purpose of Report:	To seek Cabinet approval for a revision to the terms of reference for the review panel to undertake the work to review statues, monuments, street names and building names following consideration by the Panel.
Report Owner:	Leader of the Council
Responsible Officer:	Head of Policy & Business Transformation
Elected Member and Officer Consultation:	Cabinet Member Champion for Equalities
Policy Framework:	This is a matter for Executive decision by Cabinet.
<p>Executive Summary:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In January 2021, Cabinet approved the Terms of Reference for the review panel to assist in the review of statues, monuments, street names and building names in the Vale of Glamorgan, in light of the Black Lives Matter movement as previously requested by Cabinet in November 2020. • The panel has met for the first time and has proposed that Cabinet consider making changes to the Terms of Reference to change the membership that would enhance the inclusivity and independence of the panel, including to include other political groups and to consider whether a standing representative from a history society should be included, or specific advice sought from individual experts on individual matters. 	

Recommendations

1. It is recommended that Cabinet note the contents of this report.
2. It is recommended that Cabinet consider and endorse the revised terms of reference for the review panel as described in this report and at Appendix A.
3. It is recommended that, subject to recommendation 2, Democratic Services contact the leaders of the Council's political groups to request one nomination each to join the review panel.
4. It is recommended that this report is referred to Scrutiny Committee (Learning and Culture) for their consideration and to provide a further update on the work of the review.

Reasons for Recommendations

1. To provide Cabinet with an overview of the work being undertaken in this area.
2. To enable Cabinet to consider the panel's proposals regarding the membership of the review panel.
3. To enable the representation as proposed.
4. To provide Scrutiny Committee (Learning and Culture) with an update as matters are progressing.

1. Background

- 1.1 In November 2020, Cabinet approved proposals to establish a review of statues, monuments, street names and building names to be undertaken both from an historic perspective (to ascertain any causes for concern) but also inviting consideration for future recognition of individuals or events that celebrate diversity (Minute 356 refers).
- 1.2 The previous report to Cabinet sought approval to undertake the review and to engage our communities in this important area.
- 1.3 The review will be undertaken by a panel and Cabinet requested that the terms of reference for the panel be developed and reported for consideration and approval prior to the panel being convened. The terms of reference were approved in January 2021 and referred to Scrutiny Committee (Learning & Culture) who had no additional comments to make.
- 1.4 The panel met for an introductory meeting in March 2021 and during this meeting discussed ways to further enhance the inclusivity and independence of the panel.
- 1.5 This report sets out the changes suggested by the panel which have been reflected in the terms of reference (Appendix A) and seeks approval for the same.

2. Key Issues for Consideration

- 2.1** The review panel met for an introductory meeting on 2nd March 2021. At the meeting, the Leader introduced members of the panel and presented the terms of reference.
- 2.2** In discussion, the review panel considered it appropriate to propose to Cabinet the following changes to the panel's composition:
- Removal of a standing member of the panel from a local history society, with expertise called upon from relevant societies, academia and other organisations on specific issues as they arose.
 - Extending the panel's membership to include one representative from each of the Council's political groups.
- 2.3** The panel proposed the removal of the local history society representative as a standing member of the panel in discussion as to whether one individual could readily be identified and who could offer experience across the wide range of issues which the panel would be considering.
- 2.4** The panel were very supportive of the existing references within the terms of reference to enable evidence to be heard from a wide range of people as part of the process.
- 2.5** The panel proposed extending the panel's membership to include one representative from each of the Council's political groups as a way of visibly demonstrating the inclusivity of the panel's work and a desire to make the process of considering representations and forming recommendations to Cabinet, as inclusive as possible. The panel considered this work to be a further opportunity for the Council to show the whole organisation's continued support for equalities matters.
- 2.6** Should Cabinet approve the extension of the panel's membership as described above, the Council's Democratic Services team would contact each of the leaders of the Council's political groups to seek one nomination from each group to join the review panel.
- 2.7** The panel also discussed the approval previously given by Cabinet to again request any representations from Town & Community Councils and to publish a public call for representations. These matters will be actioned in the coming weeks.
- 2.8** Following consideration of the proposals above, in light of the desire for the review panel to be as inclusive, representative and independent as possible, further changes to the terms of reference are proposed for Cabinet's consideration and endorsement:
- Removal of the Leader and Deputy Leader from the panel's membership, as it is felt inappropriate for the Leader or Deputy Leader to be members of a panel that would make recommendation to the Cabinet, which they lead. Should issues or recommendations for the consideration of the Cabinet be presented, then neither the Leader nor Deputy Leader would have had any involvement in any panel recommendations and would

therefore be independent, unbiased and uninfluenced by any previous debate.

- Chairperson of the review panel to be agreed by the members of the review panel at their first meeting by way of a simple majority vote.

- 2.9** These revisions are proposed in order to reflect the increased number of panel members due to extending the invitation for political group nominations whilst allowing the review panel's membership to be kept focused. The revisions would also increase the independence of the review panel's deliberations, with recommendations being made by the panel for Cabinet's consideration and decision. The chairperson would be a Councillor as agreed by the members of the review panel at their first meeting by way of a simple majority vote and for a period of up to one year. Any further revisions to the panel's composition may be made by Cabinet.
- 2.10** It is recommended that this report be referred to Scrutiny Committee (Learning and Culture) to provide a further update on the work progressing in this area.

3. How do proposals evidence the Five Ways of Working and contribute to our Well-being Objectives?

- 3.1** The proposals contained in this report are consistent with the Council's Strategic Equality Plan objectives which are framed in the context of the Council's four new well-being objectives. These objectives complement each other and will collectively deliver the Council's local well-being outcomes and the seven national well-being goals.

4. Resources and Legal Considerations

Financial

- 4.1** There are no direct financial implications arising from this report. The findings of the review panel's work may require financial resources to deliver and consideration of any implications will be given by Cabinet in due course.

Employment

- 4.2** There are no direct employment implications arising from this report.

Legal (Including Equalities)

- 4.3** There are no direct legal implications arising from this report. The Council has a statutory duty to comply with the Equalities Act (2010) and specific duties to Wales as described in the Strategic Equality Plan.
- 4.4** In parallel with the work described in the report above, work to develop an Equalities Impact Assessment will be undertaken. This will be an important basis

for considering the findings of any representations received, in conjunction with the equalities information contained in the Strategic Equality Plan.

5. Background Papers

[Review of Street Names ToR \(valeofglamorgan.gov.uk\)](http://valeofglamorgan.gov.uk) (Cabinet, January 2021)

[Review of Statues Monuments Street Names and Building Names \(Cabinet, November 2020\)](#)

[Statement from the Leader of the Council, June 2020](#)

[Statement from the First Minister, July 2020](#)

[Vale of Glamorgan Council Strategic Equality Plan 2020-2024](#)

Vale of Glamorgan Council Review of Statues, Monuments, Street Names and Building Names

Review Panel Terms of Reference

Purpose & Role

The panel is to be established by the Council's Cabinet to undertake work to further the Vale of Glamorgan Council's review of statues, monuments, street names and building names within the Vale of Glamorgan.

The panel will receive representations from town & community councils, the wider public, community/interest groups and review evidence relating to statues, monuments, street names and building names within the county.

The panel will also consider any emerging findings from the Welsh Government's audit of public monuments, street and building names associated with the history of black communities in Wales.

The purpose of the panel's work is to review these assets from an historic perspective (to ascertain any causes for concern) whilst also inviting consideration for future recognition of individuals or events that celebrate diversity.

Diversity in the context of the panel's work means ensuring all residents of the Vale of Glamorgan feel recognised no matter their background. For example, this will include race and Welsh language/cultural considerations.

Upon receipt of representations, the panel will review the findings and make recommendations to the Council's Cabinet to determine the action that should be taken.

Actions that could be progressed will include removal or retention with additional information/education. The actions proposed will be informed by the representations made to the panel.

Membership

The membership of the panel is as follows and may be changed by agreement of the Cabinet:

- Member Equality Champion
- Member LGBT Champion
- One Member from each of the Council's Political Groups (as nominated by Political Group Leaders)
- An officer from the Council's Strategic Leadership Team
- One representative from the Vale of Glamorgan Stand Up to Racism

The chairperson [who must be one of the Councillors on the panel] would be agreed by the members of the review panel at their first meeting by way of a simple majority vote and for a period of up to one year. Any further revisions to the panel's composition may be made by Cabinet.

Additional attendees at panel meetings will be agreed by the Chair, for example, in inviting representatives of those making representations, or to provide the panel with specialist knowledge or advice.

It is for Vale of Glamorgan Stand Up to Racism to determine their representative to sit on the panel.

It is for the Leader of each Political Group to nominate one representative to sit on the panel.

The panel will be supported by Council officers for administration and professional advisory purposes.

Accountability

The panel will make recommendations to the Council's Cabinet for determination. Reports will be referred to Scrutiny Committee (Learning & Culture) as part of the decision-making process.

Working Methods

The panel will initially receive representations invited from Town & Community councils by the end of January 2021.

All Town & Community Councils will be invited to identify commemorations of historical figures which may be the cause of concern, views on how these concerns should be addressed, and to identify people from underrepresented backgrounds to commemorate in the future.

All Town & Community councils have received a copy of the report from Cabinet setting out the approach to the review and a further reminder will be sent.

In parallel, members of the public and community/interest groups will be invited to make representations via an online form.

The findings of the Welsh Government audit will also be reviewed by the panel.

The 'call for representations' will remain active for an initial period of six months following January 2021 at which point, Cabinet will review the operation of the panel.

Information received from the representations and other sources of research/evidence will be compiled by Council officers and shared on a confidential basis with the panel for their consideration.

The meetings of the panel will be minuted, with those minutes appended to any subsequent Cabinet reports to inform decision making and scrutiny processes.

Meetings

An initial meeting of the panel will be convened in March 2021 to discuss the terms of reference and scope of the work involved.

A meeting of the panel will be convened subsequently to review the representations received to date.

Further meetings will be agreed with the panel as required.

Initially all meetings will be held using Microsoft Teams.

Review

The Cabinet will initially review the operation of the panel at the end of June 2021 to determine how long the panel should continue for, and periodically thereafter.